

Attachment D – Consultation Summary

State of California

AttDConsultationSummary

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|--|--|--------------------------|--|
| American Red Cross | Nonprofit social service | January 15, 2015 Meeting | E-mail notification; delivered PowerPoint |
| AT&T | For-profit telecommunications company | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection | State government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| California Department of Housing and Community Development | State government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| California Department of Transportation | State government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| City of Berkeley | Municipal government in Alameda County | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| City and County of San Francisco/Hetch-Hetchy | Municipal government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| City of San Jose | Municipal government in Santa Clara County | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Crook Ranch | Private cattle ranch | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Ericson Ranch | Private cattle ranch | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Evergreen Lodge | Private hotel | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Groveland Community Services District | Local water utility company | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|--------------------------|--|
| Hwy 108 Fire Safe Council | Nonprofit organization | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Me-Wuk Tribe | California Indian Tribe | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Office of Planning and Research | State government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Pacific Gas and Electric | For-profit utility company | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Rosasco Ranch | Private cattle ranch | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Sierra Pacific Industries | Private lumber company | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Strawberry Music Festival | Local music festival | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Southwest Interface Team (SWIFT) | Collaboration of government organizations and community-based organization | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Community Resource Agency (TuCare) | County government community resource agency | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Administration | County government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Agriculture Commission/Air Pollution | County department | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors | County governing board | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Cattlemen's Association | Local ranching organization | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Chamber of Commerce | Local chamber of commerce | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Community Resources Agency | County government community resources agency | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|--------------------------|--|
| Tuolumne County Economic Development Authority | County government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Farm Bureau | Nonprofit organization promoting agriculture interests | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Fire | County government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Fire Chief's Association | Nonprofit organization of county fire chiefs | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Human Services Agency | County human services agency | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Public Health Officer | County department of public health | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Sheriff's Office | County law enforcement | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Superintendent of Schools | Local school district | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Transportation Agency | County government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne County Visitor's Bureau | Nonprofit organization | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne Utilities District | County water utility company | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Turlock Irrigation District | Water utility company (outside Tuolumne County) | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Twain Harte Community Services District | Water utility company in Tuolumne County | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Yosemite Gateway Partnership | Nonprofit organization | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| Yosemite Lakes | Recreational vehicle resort and campground | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Yosemite National Park | National park | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Yosemite Stanislaus Solutions | Nonprofit corporation | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| University of California Extension Cooperative | Educational institution | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| California Environmental Protection Agency | State government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| United States Forest Service | Federal government | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Tuolumne River Trust | Nonprofit organization | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Mariposa County | County adjacent to Tuolumne County | January 15, 2015 Meeting | Same as above |
| Sierra Nevada Forests and Communities Initiative Coordinating Council | Interested group addressing issues affecting forest health, fire and related economic development | January 28, 2015 | Agenda item |
| Governor's Office of Emergency Services | State government | January-February 2015 conversations | Requested input. |
| Natural Resource Committee | Community group | January-February 2015 conversations | Requested input. |
| Resource Advisory Committee | Community group for Secure Rural Schools/Comm. Deter. Act | January-February 2015 conversations | Requested input. |
| Tuolumne County Water Policy Advisory Committee | Community advisory group | January-February 2015 conversations | Requested input. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| Tuolumne/Stanslaus Integrated Regional Water Manage. Agency | Utility district | January-February 2015 conversations | Requested input. |
| Tuolumne County Multi-Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Committee | Multi-jurisdictional committee | January-February 2015 conversations | Requested input. |
| Tuolumne County Habitat for Humanity | Nonprofit | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Tuolumne County Ministerial Association | Ministerial association | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Interfaith Community Social Services | Social services organization | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Tuolumne County Ombudsman | Social services organization | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Tuolumne County Catholic Charities | Social services organization | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Tuolumne County Veterans Service Office | County government | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Infant/Child Enrichment Services | Nonprofit | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Area 12 Agency on Aging | Joint powers agreement social service organization | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Sierra Senior Providers | Nonprofit | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Amador Tuolumne County Action Agency | Joint powers agreement action agency | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| Mother Lode Job Training | Workforce Investment Board job center | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Social Services Transportation Advisory Committee | Advisory committee to local government | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Tuolumne County Transportation Council | Local government | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| California Conservation Corps | State government | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| California Department of Transportation | State government | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| Charlson Cattle | Private citizen | January-February 2015 conversations | Agenda item |
| California BioDiversity Council Interagency Alignment Team | Interagency group including State, federal and local levels | February 19, 2015 | Agenda item |
| Tuolumne County Superintendent of Schools | Local school district | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Public hearing (in English and Spanish) noticed from February 18 to March 13, 2015, throughout the State, Tuolumne County offices, Tuolumne-Union Democrat newspaper (three times); posted on California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) web site; sent to list serves of HCD and Governor's Office of Policy and Research; posted on Tuolumne County web site; posted in three newspapers of general circulation (three times). |
| Columbia College | Community college | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|------------------------------|--|
| Give Someone a Chance | Nonprofit homelessness organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Give Someone a Chance | Nonprofit homelessness organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Southwest Interface Team (SWIFT) | Collaboration of government organizations and community-based organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| CT Bioenergy Consulting | Private consulting | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Community Resources Agency | County government community resources agency | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Georgetown County School District | Local school district | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Fire Department | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|------------------------------|--|
| Tuolumne County Transportation Commission | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Economic Development Association | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne Band of MeWuk | Tribal government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Catholic Charities | Nonprofit social services organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Georgetown County School District | Local school district | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Columbia College | Community college | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| James Dambacher Construction | Private construction firm | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Hotel Charlotte and Groveland Area Partnership | Private hotel and nonprofit community-based organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection | State government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| U.S. Forest Service | Federal government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne Utility District | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|------------------------------|--|
| McCaffrey House Inn | For-profit enterprise | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Telele Foundation, Sierra Watershed Progressive | Nonprofit corporation and for-profit corporation | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Yosemite Stanislaus Solutions (YSS) and Tuolumne County Alliance for Resources and Environment (TuCare) | Nonprofit corporations | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Groveland Trail Heads | Nonprofit educational organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Peter and Penny Jelito | Private citizens | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Karen Seals | Private citizen | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Cvcvy Seals | Private citizen | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Sparq Environmental, Inc. | Private consulting firm | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| California Department of Fish and Wildlife | State government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|------------------------------|--|
| U.S. Forest Service | Federal government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Groveland Trail Heads | Nonprofit educational organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| BigOakFlat/Groveland USD | Local school district | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Central Sierra Environmental Resource Center | Nonprofit organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| U.S. Department of Agriculture Forest Service | Federal government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection | State government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors | County governing board | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Cattlemen's Association | Local ranching organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors | County governing board | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Frank Mikkelsen, DDS | Private citizen | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Visitors Bureau | Nonprofit organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne Utility District | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne Utility District | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Tuolumne County Transportation Agency | County government | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

| Agency Name or Stakeholder Group (if applicable) | Agency Type - Target Population (If applicable) | Type of Outreach | - Method of Notification - Materials Provided |
|---|--|------------------------------|---|
| Yosemite Chamber of Commerce | Chamber of commerce | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Catholic Charities | Social services nonprofit organization | March 2, 2015 Public Hearing | Same as above. |
| Interested public | Public webinar | March 3, 2015 Public Webinar | Public Webinar to provide opportunity for out-of-area citizens to provide input. The Webinar was noticed as a part of the public notice for the public hearing of March 2, 2015. Also posted on California Department of Housing and Community Development web site and Tuolumne County web site. |

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

Phase 1 Public Comment Summary and Responses

As noted in Attachment D “Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary,” the public has had three formal opportunities, in addition to stakeholder meetings, to comment on California’s Phase 1 Application to the National Disaster Resilience Competition (NDRC). In addition, the public has open access to submit comments, questions, and suggested projects through the State’s NDRC website at: <http://www.hcd.ca.gov/NationalDisaster/ResilienceCompetition.html>. The public and all stakeholders were invited to comment on the State’s Phase 1 Application between February 18, 2015, and 5:00pm, March 13, 2015. A public hearing was held in Tuolumne County on March 2, 2015, where the public was invited to ask questions and submit written comments, and a statewide webinar was held on March 3, 2015, for the same purposes. Participants were informed that the NDRC website had a Public Comment Tool with which to send written comments electronically during the comment period. And, on an ongoing basis, the website includes a Project Submission Form and an email address – CA-NDRC@hcd.ca.gov - that may be used at any time to submit comments, ask questions, and suggest project ideas.

Written Commenters:

Michael McCaffery – Private Business Owner – McCaffery House, Bed and Breakfast Inn

Tyler Summersett – Tuolumne Transportation Council

Nathan Graveline – California Department of Fish and Wildlife

Dwight Follien – Groveland Trail Heads

John L. Gray – Chairman, Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors, on behalf of the Tuolumne County Board of Supervisors

Margie Bulkin – Tuolumne County Superintendent of Schools (TCSoS)

Angie Fairchilds – President, Columbia College

Thomas P. O’Rourke, Sr. – Chairman, Yurok Tribe (Del Norte County/2011 Tsunami)

Gina M. Fromer – California State Director, Trust for Public Land

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

Mick Grimes – (no affiliation listed in his email)

Kerri Timmer – Sierra Business Council

Comment Topics and Responses:

Executive Summary - A comment was received that the case could be strengthened by adding more detail. Specifically: 1) the Rim Fire was the largest-ever in the Sierra Nevada recorded history, almost 40 percent burned at destructive high intensity, producing GHG emissions equivalent to 2.3 million vehicles for a year, 2) the losses in visits/lodging receipts of approximately \$2.75 million (Sierra Nevada Conservancy), 3) the fact that San Francisco PUC had to purchase alternative energy due to damage done to hydropower facilities (Sierra Nevada Conservancy), and 4) more information about fire risk in the rest of the Sierra, as a way of indicating that the work funded under this program in the Rim Fire area would be useful elsewhere in the Sierra. Sentence could read: "The same is true in other parts of the State, especially the west slope of the Sierra. Overall more acres have burned in the last two decades than any other previously recorded decade, and more land has burned in the first 4-1/2 years of this decade than seven entire decades in the past." (Sierra Nevada Conservancy, "The State of the Sierra Nevada's Forests").

Response: The NDRC Team appreciates these comments and has taken them under advisement while finalizing the Phase 1 Application.

Exhibit B – Threshold – National Object/Overall Benefit: Comments were received expressing concern that the Phase 1 Application only reiterated the National Objective and Overall Objective language from the NOFA.

Response: The Phase 1 Application instructions from HUD were to restate the requirement since in this part of the process projects are not being submitted for funding. Only the framework/approach to resiliency and projects related to threshold requirements are included at this stage. The national

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

objective(s) and overall benefit criteria will be defined in our Phase 2 application, should the State advance to Phase 2.

Exhibit C – Capacity: A comment was received about ways to strengthen the Capacity section, including: clarification of the definitions and differences between the "Oversight Steering Committee" and "Leadership Partners"; strengthen the background on our NDRC partner – ARCCA; reference the USFS Experimental Forests, including the Stanislaus-Tuolumne Experimental Forest; add more detail regarding the additional benefits the Sierra Nevada provides to the rest of the state such as: carbon storage to assist with addressing climate change impacts, wood products, hydropower [the Sierra provides 55 percent of the State's overall hydropower, and that equals 15 percent of the State's overall energy per year (per CEC)], and crucial habitat for key species, some of which are only found in the Sierra; mention the connection between rural resources areas and the downstream communities that depend on those resources; explore ways to bring additional data tools to better reflect the location of disadvantaged people throughout the State, especially in the rural regions of the Sierra and other resource-rich headwaters areas of the State since the CalEnviroScreen Tool focuses on urban areas.

Response: The NDRC Team appreciates these comments and has taken them under advisement while finalizing the Phase 1 Application. With specific regard to CalEnviroScreen, the mention of this tool is to illustrate an example of how California is on the forefront of developing and utilizing ways to identify vulnerable populations to address their needs.

Exhibit D – Need/Extent of the Problem –

Education: Comments were received regarding support for the local Community College – Columbia College - to develop Career Pathways Programs that will yield jobs necessary to build resiliency in the Rim Fire region. The goal is to develop a program that results in Columbia College's becoming a Certification Center for Fire Technology.

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

Centralized Transportation Center: A comment was received stating that because County schools are involved in transportation and/or bus service to people out of unsafe areas or at risk, we would benefit from a centralized transportation center to create resilient flow of transportation resources.

Wildlife : Wildlife should be part of the impact statement and strategic planning process. The Spotted Owl has an enormous impact on forest management. Many of the challenges we face in creating/maintaining a resilient forest are tied to wildlife-related lawsuits. Consideration need to be given to this issue to achieve long-term resiliency.

Response: The NDRC Team appreciates these comments and will take them under advisement while moving through the Phase 2 process with regard to projects and activities and their effects on wildlife.

Exhibit E- Soundness of Approach: Comments were received that the job training and small business development goals sections could be strengthened with a connection to the Merced Small Business Development Center that serves the Tuolumne County area (<http://www.alliancesbdc.com>). Comments were also received regarding the 190+ days that hotel reservations were canceled due to the fire and local income lost at that time, and regarding the application's focus predominately on forest health rather than incorporating more economic development and trail projects as economic development projects into the application.

Response: The NDRC Leadership Team appreciates the suggestion of the Merced Small Business Development Center and will reach out to them to discuss the application. Further, the County through its Economic Development Association, and others on the NDRC leadership team, reached out to the local business owners who were economically affected. However, none of the businesses have reported continued income losses of 10 percent due to the Rim Fire. There was reluctance by the business owners to submit revenue/loss documentation for purposes of the grant application. The Phase 1 Application is meant to establish an approach/framework for determining the path to resiliency rather than outlining the projects to be addressed. In Phase 2, should the State

Citizen Participation and Consultation Summary Chart, State of California, March 2015

be selected to move forward, the NDRC Leadership Team will be conducting a series of regular meeting in Tuolumne County to discuss potential resilience recovery projects at which time we will encourage discussion of trail work and other economic development ideas.

Other Qualifying Disasters: Comments were received that the 2011 Tsunami and its impact on the Yurok Tribal Area at the mouth of the Klamath River should be included in the NDRC application as a conceptually consistent community investment opportunity.

Response: Early in the NDRC process, the NDRC Team consulted with Crescent City and the Yurok Tribe about the potential for inclusion in the application. Given the time limits on the competition and resource constraints at the State level, the Rim Fire was selected as the State's focus for the application. The California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection Agency (CAL FIRE), Tuolumne County, the U.S. Forest Service, and the Sierra Nevada Conservancy already had extensive data with regard to the fire, its damage, and needed recovery. Additionally, the State faces its fourth consecutive year of extreme drought, California's forested watershed health, wildfire threat, and air quality are of critical importance to all Californians. The NDRC Team acknowledges the environmental deterioration at the mouth of the Klamath River and the challenges the Tribe faces with the threat of Tsunami. Further conversations are being proposed to find ways to address these important issues, however, inclusion in the NDRC application is not feasible at this time.
